

Minutes of the Meeting
Board of Civil Authority
August 12, 2021

Present: Jean Strong Laura Lienhard Alice Nitka
 Joyce Washburn Terri Carter Herbert VanGuilder
 Ulla Cook, Town Clerk
 Jeannie Stasz, Lister
 Matt Krajewski, Appraiser
 Ryan Silvestri, Appraiser

Jessica Lavalley, Appellant

The meeting was called to order by Chair Jean Strong at 1:00PM.

The oath was given to the Listers and BCA Members. The oath was given to the appellant.

Jeremy and Jessica Lavalley, 89 Northshore Drive, parcel 200324.000

Ryan Silvestri presented for the listers.

The assessment for 2021 for this property is \$572,700
This property consists of a well maintained 1192 square foot home with direct frontage on Lake Rescue. The parcel is located in a Lake Very Good neighborhood consisting of .28 acres. A well-manicured and fully improve slope with a stone stairway stopping halfway at a bluestone deck an apportioned with a stone fireplace. Continuing down the stairs one would come to a grassy landing with access to a private dock and approximately 52 feet of linear lake frontage.

The 3 bedroom home originally built in 1985 is in good condition for its age with mostly updated materials throughout the exterior and interior. Basic fixtures are fitted throughout the interior with a slightly above average kitchen. The home also consists of a full rear walkout basement that is currently unfinished.

Mr. Silvestri also included a market analysis and equity analysis in his presentation

Comparable sales are 37 Northshore Drive selling for \$630,000 on July 27, 2018, 99 Fishing Access Road selling for \$574,700 on December 13, 2019 and 1484 Route 100 North selling for \$490,000 on September 20, 2018.

The market analysis conclusion presented by Mr. Silvestri showed sale number one having an adjusted sale price of \$597,260, comparable 2 \$587,700 and comparable 3 \$553,460. He feels that the assed value of \$572,700 is fairly and equitable assessed. The market sales indicate a range of value between \$553,000 and \$597,700.

Mr. Silvestri stated the unique the subject property would draw the attention of buyers looking for Vermont Lake and or ski home. One of the most unique characteristics of properties on Lake Rescue is that they do service both summer and winter season. There is increased demand for properties in the lake districts. I have included a listing with a contingent sale for 102 Lake Shore Drive, next door to appellant, for \$695,000.

Jessica Lavalley stated she originally started this process because I wanted to understand where the number came from and was given no information that would help me understand. I am really frustrated with this process because I have been more that cooperative with the town. I have gone through this process before. I have done no changes to my property since the last appeal and to have an increase of 39% when nothing has changed and I cannot get an explanation. That is not a fair analysis. I have neighbors whose property only increased only 9 percent or some went down.

Ms. Lavalley presented some comparables – 83 Northshore Drive sold for \$440,000, assessed now for \$588,000 an increase of 39% same as mine but it is completely renovated , 63 Benson Point sold for \$752,500 and now assessed for \$529,600 is up 30 %, 74 Slacks Pasture sold for \$365,000 sold for less than currently assessed, assessed value increased 13%. The percentage of increase is all over the place. Some homes sold for less than assessed value some sold for more. I don't understand how you can justify a 3% increase when the percentages of increase ranged from 9.4 to 39. I don't understand the rationale.

Ryan Silvestri responded to Ms. Lavalley that looking at percentage change. When you look for equity in a correlation between percentage of change from old assessment to new assessment doesn't really show you equity in the process as a whole what you want to look at is current assessment versus current assessment and comparing those numbers and those aspects of the property because when we do a town wide reappraisal the old values, new assessments when you need to come up to 100 percent of market value have to change at different rates. Some go down some go up. The overall average for all 3562 parcels was a plus 10 percent. The last data change was 2005. The building data had not been consistently collected for 13 years. In a perfect world if the assessments from 2005 were all perfect, then we could just say take new photos and do a market analysis and increase all the properties by 10 percent. That that obviously is not the case, there are many variables that go into a process like this that affect change. We wanted to give the town longevity and we are anticipating a market change. We need to have the reappraisal to be validated by the State of Vermont because what they look at is current assessments versus sales price and they want us to be within 10 percent.

Laura Lienhard asked why this property went up 39 percent. Matt Krajewski responded when we do a town wide reappraisal it is completely independent analysis of anything that has occurred in the past. We do not use a previous assessment as any sort of benchmark as to where we need to be today. We are strictly looking at sales that have occurred going back three years from our appraisal date of April 1, 2021. It is the duty of the appellant to show us why they cannot sell their house for what we have it currently assessed at. How we arrived at that number compared to what the old is completely irrelevant. Those are two completely different markets we are looking at. You are trying to use as some sort of benchmark as to where we need to be. The goal is to achieve fair market value. You cannot compare percentages of change.

Herbert VanGuilder questioned land values. Ryan Silvestri responded we have land schedules. We take into consideration view, lake frontage, lake access or slope side and if a lot in the same proximity does not, we would make get an adjustment.

Inspection committee to consist of Terry Carter, Chair, Laura Lienhard, Judith Pullinen and Jean Strong. Inspection schedule for 8/13 at 3:30.

Daniel Blake - 254 North Hill Crossroad, parcel 040418.000

Ryan Silvestri stated this property consists of an A-frame camp style building originally constructed in 1968. The building is in fair/average condition overall with low quality, mostly original interior finishes. The building is graded D fair for its size and lack of design. It sits on a one acre lot. His suggestion is to reduce the value after further review of sales to \$82,900.

Dan Blake responded on the telephone that he would accept the \$82,500.

Alice Nitka asked Ryan Silvestri why he wanted to reduce it. A camp building is more comparable to this and change the grade to a D- and make an adjustment of 20 percent for the narrow lot. These adjustments lowered the value to \$82,900. Motion was made by Herbie VanGuilder to accept the \$82,900, second made by Alice Nitka. Motion was voted and passed unanimously.

Julian Croxall, Ford Farm Lane, parcel 070305.000

Ryan Silvestri stated this is a 2.11 acre vacant house site located in rural good neighborhood. The lot is not cleared but does have good road frontage on the cul-de-sac. There have been 39 vacant land sales during the reappraisal window. It is worth noting that recently there has been a decline in land sales due to high prices of construction materials and shortage of builders. This was considered during the lister grievance process and is reflected in the 21,000 reduction in value. Comparable sales a 1.51 acre vacant house site in rural average neighborhood sold on 9/24/202 for \$50,000 located on Lathrop Loop, 1.05 acres lot in rural good neighborhood sold on February 8, 2021 for \$79,000 located on Partridge Road, 10.02 acres in rural average neighborhood sold on October 19, 2018 for \$78,00 located South Hill Crossroad. The market sales indicate a range of between \$66,200 and \$82,300

Mr. Croxall stated in his letter the he has been trying to sell this property since 2013 at a price of \$79,000 and then reduced the price to \$60,000. Then he attempted a sale by owner reducing the price as low as \$29,000. It has recently been listed for \$65,000. During all this time not a single offer was received. He listed comparable 5 Trailview Road, 2.71 acres sold on 4/9/21 for \$30,000, 0 Pleasant Street 2 acres sold 9/21/18 for \$15,000, Lot 34 Ellison Loop 2.08 acres sold 12/13/19 sold for \$34,000 and 46 Partridge Road 1.38 acres 10/17/19 for 30,000.

Ulla Cook stated as this is land only the property owner does not have to be there during the inspection per letter from Jenny Prosser General Counsel & Director of Municipal Assistance.

Inspection committee Jean Strong, Chair, Alice Nitka, Joyce Washburn, Judy Pullinen, Terry Gurdak Carter

Other Business – Schedule for proposed tax appeals was given out with next meeting schedule for August 30. Chairman Jean Strong stated during site visits no questions can be asked.

Ryan Silvestre asked the inspection committee to pay attention to the interior how many bathrooms, how much of the basement is finished. Bathrooms and kitchens rated average, below average, nice or really nice. Because of covid we were unable to get into the interior of the houses. Ryan clarified that a ½ bath is toilet and sink, ¾ is 3 fixtures toilet, sink shower, full bath 4 fixtures toilet, sink and a shower/bath combination. Bidet, Double sink vanities are classified as other fixtures. Describe what you see.

Ryan we did try to back off on the last 16 months of the pandemic level sales of sales by 6 to 8 percent. History tells us that markets will correct themselves.

Meeting adjourned at 2:40 PM motion made by Terri Carter, second by Laura Lienhard.

Respectfully submitted,

Ulla Cook, Clerk